

STATE OF NEW JERSEY Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 1st Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350 www.nj.gov/bpu/

<u>ENERGY</u>

IN THE MATTER OF THE PROVISION OF BASIC GENERATION SERVICE (BGS) FOR THE PERIOD BEGINNING JUNE 1, 2024 ORDER

)

)

DOCKET NO. ER23030124

Parties of Record:

Brian O. Lipman, Esq., Director, New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel Philip J. Passanante, Esq., Associate General Counsel for Atlantic City Electric Company James Meehan, Esq., on behalf of Jersey Central Power & Light Company Aaron Karp, Esq., on behalf of Public Service Electric and Gas Company Margaret Comes, Esq., Senior Attorney for Rockland Electric Company

BY THE BOARD:1

By Order dated November 17, 2023, the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board") approved the joint Basic Generation Service ("BGS") proposal by Atlantic City Electric Company ("ACE"), Jersey Central Power & Light Company ("JCP&L"), Public Service Electric and Gas Company ("PSE&G"), and Rockland Electric Company ("RECO") (collectively, "EDCs"), to hold two (2) descending clock auctions to secure the EDCs' BGS electricity requirements for the period beginning June 1, 2024.² To mitigate risk to ratepayers, the Board directed the EDCs to procure, through the auction, approximately one-third of their BGS residential and small commercial pricing ("BGS-RSCP") customers' load for a 36-month period via a single clearing price for each EDC's BGS supply requirements.³ The Board also directed the EDCs to use a 12-month procurement period for their hourly load BGS commercial and industrial energy pricing ("BGS-CIEP") customers.

¹ Commissioner Marian Abdou did not participate.

² In re the Provision of Basic Generation Service (BGS) For the Period Beginning June 1, 2024, BPU Docket No. ER23030124, Order dated November 17, 2023 ("November 2023 Order").

³ Approximately two-thirds of the EDCs' BGS-RSCP requirements are already under contract through May 31, 2025, and one-third through May 31, 2026 as a result of the 2022 and 2023 BGS-RSCP Auctions.

In the November 2023 Order, the Board committed to reviewing the results of both the BGS-RSCP Auction and the BGS-CIEP Auction (collectively, "BGS Auctions" or "Auctions") in their entirety and certify the results of each auction for all EDCs, or for no EDC, no later than the second business day following the close of the last Auction. If approved, those results would be converted into customers' revised BGS rates beginning June 1, 2024. This is the 23rd year the Board will consider a similar process to secure BGS supply.

The Auction Manager responsible for conducting the 2024 BGS Auctions is National Economic Research Associates ("NERA"). NERA, an expert in conducting simultaneous descending clock auctions in the energy and telecommunications industries, was the Auction Manager for each prior BGS Auction. Board Staff ("Staff") and the Board's consultant, Bates White, LLC ("Bates White"), continuously monitored the 2024 Auctions. Bates White has a history of monitoring simultaneous descending clock auctions and consulting within the energy industry.

On January 5, 2024, the EDCs filed a letter requesting that they be required to file post-BGS-Auction Tariff sheets seven (7) days after the results of the Third Incremental Reliability Pricing Model ("RPM") Auction become available. The EDCs noted this would permit them to account for the actual Capacity Price for the 2024/2025 Delivery year, thus avoiding duplicative filings and allowing each EDC's final rate design to better match its actual payment to suppliers.

BGS-CIEP AUCTION SUMMARY

The BGS-CIEP Auction was conducted on February 2, 2024; it ended the same day after 25 rounds with 38 total tranches secured, resulting in the following closing prices for each EDC:⁴

EDC	Closing Price (\$/Mw-day)	Total Tranches Sold
ACE	370.86	4
JCP&L	357.14	12
PSE&G	378.21	21
RECO	300.84	1

A list of the BGS-CIEP Auction winners is included in Attachment A to this Order.

BGS-RSCP AUCTION SUMMARY

The BGS-RSCP Auction began on February 5, 2024, and ended on February 6, 2024 after 29 rounds with 57 total tranches secured, resulting in the following closing prices for each EDC:⁵

EDC	Closing Price (cents/kWh)	Total Tranches Sold
ACE	8.142	7
JCP&L	8.295	20
PSE&G	8.088	29
RECO	8.555	1

⁴ Tranche sizes are approximate amounts of BGS-CIEP eligible load as follows: ACE- 81.50 MW, JCP&L-73.06 MW, PSE&G- 74.34 MW and RECO- 49.30 MW.

⁵ Tranche sizes are approximate amounts of BGS-RSCP eligible load for a three (3)-year term as follows: ACE- 104.60 MW, JCP&L- 91.47 MW, PSE&G- 92.21 MW and RECO- 82.68 MW.

A list of the BGS-RSCP Auction winners is included in Attachment A to this Order.

BGS AUCTION OVERSIGHT

NERA provided a confidential post-Auction checklist form evaluating the BGS Auctions. NERA concluded that the Board should accept the Auction results, indicating, in part, that:

- no issues or questions unresolved prior to the Auctions created bidder uncertainty;
- neither procedural problems nor errors occurred during the Auctions;
- all prescribed communication protocols were followed;
- neither hardware, software, nor communication system problems occurred;
- no security breaches were observed during the Auction process;
- all guidelines for setting or changing the Auction parameters were followed;
- there was no evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that materially delayed or impaired the Auctions;
- communication between the Auction Manager and bidders was timely and effective;
- there was no evidence showing the bidders were rushed;
- no complaints were received from the bidders;
- the Auctions were carried out in a fair and transparent manner;
- there was no evidence of collusion or gaming by the bidders;
- public and sensitive information was treated appropriately;
- there were no exogenous factors that materially affected the Auctions; and
- the Auctions generated a result consistent with competitive bidding, market-determined prices, and efficient allocation of the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP loads.

Bates White provided the Board with a confidential post-Auction evaluation form and a supplemental checklist reviewing how the Board conducted the Auctions. Bates White's analysis is consistent with NERA's analysis. Both NERA and Bates White recommend that the Board accept the final Auction results.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The independent NERA and Bates White analyses both conclude that the Auctions proceeded without meaningful interruption, according to the Board-approved Auction Rules, and in a fair and transparent manner. As such, both NERA and Bates White recommend that the Board certify the Auction results. Staff charged with overseeing the Auctions briefed the Board regarding the procedure and results of each Auction.

After reviewing the checklists and evaluation forms from NERA and Bates White, discussing the results and the conduct of the Auctions with Staff, NERA and Bates White, and observing the Auctions, the Board <u>HEREBY</u> FINDS that:

- all bidders received sufficient information to prepare for the Auctions;
- information was generally provided to bidders in accordance with the published timetable, and the timetable was adjusted appropriately as needed;
- there were no Auction issues or questions that created material bidder uncertainty unresolved prior to the Auctions;
- there occurred neither procedural problems nor errors throughout the Auctions, including with the electronic bidding process, the back-up bidding process, and communications between bidders and the Auction Manager;

- the bidders and the Auction Manager adhered to communication protocols;
- appropriate data back-up procedures were planned and carried out;
- no security breaches were observed during the Auction process;
- the EDCs, NERA, Staff, the Board, and Bates White followed the prescribed communication protocols during the Auctions;
- protocols were followed for decisions regarding changes in the Auction parameters (e.g. volume, load cap, bid decrements);
- the Auction Manager double-checked or reproduced calculations (e.g. for bid decrements or bidder eligibility) produced by the Auction software off-line;
- there is no evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that delayed or impaired the Auctions;
- communications between the Auction Manager and bidders were timely and effective;
- there were no complaints about the process from the bidders;
- the Auctions were carried out in an acceptably fair and transparent manner;
- there was no evidence of gaming on the part of bidders;
- there was no evidence of collusion among bidders;
- information was made public in an appropriate manner and, from what could be observed, sensitive information was treated appropriately;
- there are no concerns regarding the Auctions' outcome as to any specific EDC(s); and
- the Auctions generated a result consistent with competitive bidding, market-determined prices, and efficient allocation of the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP loads.

Based upon the foregoing, the Board <u>HEREBY CERTIFIES</u> the final results of the BGS Auctions in their entirety, and <u>HEREBY APPROVES</u> the closing prices for each EDC. The Board <u>HEREBY</u> <u>APPROVES</u> the EDCs' request to file post-BGS Auction Tariff sheets seven (7) days after the results of the Third Incremental RPM Auction are known, but no later than April 1, 2024. Furthermore, the Board <u>HEREBY ORDERS</u> the EDCs to: 1) execute the necessary documents, including the BGS Supplier Master Agreements, with the winning bidders; 2) implement the BGS rates resulting from the Auctions beginning June 1, 2024; and 3) file tariff sheets reflecting those rates seven (7) days after the results of the Third Incremental RPM Auction are known, but no later than April 1, 2024.

Additionally, by Order dated January 31, 2024, the Board certified the final results of the RECO Request for Proposal ("RFP") in its entirety and approved the winning bid price for RECO's non-PJM BGS load to be rolled into the final BGS-RSCP Auction prices approved by the Board.⁶ The Board further directed RECO to execute the necessary documents with the winning bidder. Accordingly, Staff recommends that the Board direct RECO to: 1) implement the BGS rates resulting from the RFP as blended with the approved auction prices beginning June 1, 2024; and 2) file tariff sheets reflecting those blended rates no later than April 1, 2024.

Consistent with past Board practice, the Board is releasing the names of the winning bidders at this time. However, the Board will not release the specific tranche and service area details for each successful bidder to avoid compromising the winning bidders' positions in the marketplace. The Board plans to make this additional information public prior to June 1, 2024.

⁶ In re the Provision of Basic Generation Service (BGS) for the Period Beginning June 1, 2024 - Decision and Order on RECO RFP, BPU Docket No. ER23030124, Order dated January 31, 2024.

The effective date of this Board Order is February 8, 2024.

DATED: February 8, 2024

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES BY:

RISTINE GUHL S DO C PRESIDENT

TA DR. ZENON CHRISTODOULOU COMMISSIONER

MICHAEL BANGE COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document is a true copy of the original in the files of the Board of Public Utilities.

SHERRI L. GOLDEN BOARD SECRETARY

ATTACHMENT A

In the Matter of the Provision of Basic Generation Service for the Period Beginning June 1, 2024

Docket No. ER23030124

Auction Winners Approved by the Board of Public Utilities on February 8, 2024

BGS-RSCP Auction Winners

Axpo U.S. LLC BP Energy Company Calpine Energy Services LP ConocoPhillips Company Constellation Energy Generation, LLC DTE Energy Trading, Inc. DXT Commodities North America Inc. Five Elements Energy II LLC Hartree Partners, L.P. Macquarie Energy, LLC NextEra Energy Marketing, LLC Shell Energy North America (US), L.P. Vitol Inc.

BGS-CIEP Auction Winners

Boston Energy Trading and Marketing, LLC ConocoPhillips Company Constellation Energy Generation, LLC DTE Energy Trading, Inc. NextEra Energy Marketing, LLC

IN THE MATTER OF THE PROVISION OF BASIC GENERATION SERVICE (BGS) FOR THE PERIOD BEGINNING JUNE 1, 2024

DOCKET NO. ER23030124

BPU

44 South Clinton Ave., 1st Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Sherri L. Golden, Secretary board.secretary@bpu.nj.gov

Robert Brabston, Esq. Executive Director robert.brabston@bpu.nj.gov

Stacy Peterson Deputy Executive Director stacy.peterson@bpu.nj.gov

Heather Weisband, Senior Counsel heather.weisband@bpu.nj.gov

Division of Law 25 Market Street Post Office Box 112 Trenton, NJ 08625-0112

Pamela Owen, DAG pamela.owen@law.njoag.gov

Matko Ilic, DAG matko.ilic@law.njoag.gov

Terel Klein, DAG terel.klein@law.njoag.gov

Daren Eppley, DAG daren.eppley@law.njoag.gov

BPU's BGS CONSULTANTS

Frank Mossburg, Managing Director Bates White, LLC 2001 K Street, NW North Building, Suite 500 Washington DC, 20006 <u>frank.mossburg@bateswhite.com</u>

Service List

DIVISION OF RATE COUNSEL

140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, New Jersey 08625

Brian Lipman, Esq., Director <u>blipman@rpa.nj.gov</u>

David Wand, Esq., Managing Attorney <u>dwand@rpa.nj.gov</u>

Debra Layugan, Paralegal <u>dlayugan@rpa.nj.gov</u>

Rate Counsel Consultant

Patricio Silva Synapse Energy Economics, Inc. 485 Massachusetts Ave., Suite 2 Cambridge, MA 02139 psilva@synpase-energy.com

PSE&G

Terrance J. Moran 80 Park Plaza, T-13 Newark, NJ 07102-4194 terrance.moran@pseg.com

Aaron Karp, Esq. 80 Park Plaza, T-5 Newark, NJ 07102-4194 <u>aaron.karp@pseg.com</u>

Myron Filewicz, BGS Manager 80 Park Plaza, T-5 <u>myron.filewicz@pseg.com</u>

ACE

Pepco Holdings, LLC – 92DC56 500 N. Wakefield Drive PO Box 6066 Newark, DE 19714-6066

Susan DeVito susan.devito@pepcoholdings.com

Philip J. Passanante, Esq. philip.passanante@pepcoholdings.com

Solomon David, Esq. solomon.david@exelopcorp.com

Peter Samuel peter.samuel@pepcoholdings.com

Deborah Sears deborah.sears2@exeloncorp.com

JCP&L

300 Madison Avenue Morristown, NJ 07962-1911

Jennifer Spricigo jspricigo@firstenergycorp.com

Yongmei Peng ypeng@firstenergycorp.com

James Meehan, Esq. jameehan@firstenergycorp.com

341 White Pond Drive A-WAC-C2 Akron, OH 44320

Randy Feucht rfeucht@firstenergycorp.com

Courtney Luff <u>caluff@firstenergycorp.com</u>

IN THE MATTER OF THE PROVISION OF BASIC GENERATION SERVICE (BGS) FOR THE PERIOD BEGINNING JUNE 1, 2024

DOCKET NO. ER23030124

Service List

ROCKLAND

4 Irving Place New York, NY 10003

John L. Carley, Esq. carleyj@coned.com

William A. Atzl, Jr. atzlw@coned.com

Margaret Comes, Esq., comesm@coned.com

NERA

1255 23rd Street NW, Suite 600 Washington, DC 20037

Chantale LaCasse chantale.lacasse@nera.com

Rachel Northcutt rachel.northcutt@nera.com

NERA Economic Consulting 777 S. Figueroa, Suite 1950 Los Angests, CA 90017

Kathleen Orlandi <u>kathleen.orlandi@nera.com</u>

Paul Cardona paul.cardona@nera.com

Third Party Suppliers

Murray E. Bevan, Esq. Bevan, Mosca, Giuditta & Zarillo, P.C. 222 Mount Airy Road, Suite 200 Basking Ridge, NJ 07920 mbevan@bmgzlaw.com

Marc A. Hanks Senior Manager, Government & Regulatory Affairs Direct Energy Services, LLC <u>Marc.Hanks@directenergy.com</u>

Stacey Rantala National Energy Marketers Association 3333 K Street, N.W., Suite 110 Washington, D.C. 20007 srantala@energymarketers.com

NJLEUC

Paul F. Forshay, Partner Eversheds-Sutherland, LLP 700 Sixth Street, NW, Suite 700 Washington, D.C. 20001-3980 paul.forshay@evershedssutherland.com

Steven S. Goldenberg, Esq. Giordano, Halleran & Ciesla, P.A. 125 Half Mile Road, Suite 300 Red Bank, NJ 07701 sgoldenberg@ghclaw.com

BGS Suppliers

Steven Gabel - IEPNJ Gabel Associates 417 Denison Street Highland Park, NJ 08904 steven@gabelassociates.com

Holly Reed Gabel Associates 417 Denison Street Highland Park, NJ 08904 holly.reed@gabelassociates.com

Raymond Depillo PSEG Services Corporation 80 Park Plaza, T-19 P.O. Box 570 Newark, NJ 07101 raymond.depillo@pseg.com

Shawn P. Leyden, Esq. PSEG Energy Resources & Trade 80 Park Plaza, T-19 P. O. Box 570 Newark, NJ 07101 shawn.leyden@pseg.com

Kathleen Maher Constellation New Energy 810 Seventh Avenue, Suite 400 New York, NY 10019-5818 kathleen.maher@constellation.com

David B. Applebaum Director, Regulatory Affairs NextEra Energy Resources, LLC 21 Pardee Place Ewing, New Jersey 08628 david.applebaum@nexteraenergy.com David Gil Manager, Regulatory Affairs NextEra Energy Resources, LLC 700 Universe Boulevard Juno Beach, Florida 33408 david.gil@nexteraenergy.com

David K Richter, Esq. PSEG Regulatory Department 80 Park Plaza, T-5C P. O. Box 570 Newark, NJ 07101 david.richter@pseg.com Craig S. Blume

Director, Power Marketing UGI Energy Services / UGI Development Company One Meridian Boulevard, Suite 2C01 Wyomissing, PA 19610 <u>cblume@ugies.com</u>

Cynthia Klots, General Counsel DTE Energy Trading, Inc. 414 South Main Street Suite 200 Ann Arbor, MI 48104 cynthia.klots@dteenergy.com

Don Hubschman American Electric Power 155 W. Nationwide Blvd. Columbus, OH 43215 <u>dmhubschman@aepes.com</u>

Christine McGarvey AEP Energy Partners, Inc. Energy Trader 155 W Nationwide Blvd Suite 500 Columbus, OH 43215 clmcgarvey@aepes.com

Matthew Davies TransCanada Power Marketing Ltd. 110 Turnpike Road, Suite300 Westborough, MA 01581 matthew_daview@transcanada.com

Becky Merola Noble Americas Energy Solutions, LLC 5325 Sheffield Avenue Powell, OH 43065 <u>bmerola@noblesolutions.com</u>

IN THE MATTER OF THE PROVISION OF BASIC GENERATION SERVICE (BGS) FOR THE PERIOD BEGINNING JUNE 1, 2024

DOCKET NO. ER23030124

Service List

Glenn Riepl AEP Energy Services 1 Riverside Plaza 14th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-2373 gfriepl@aep.com

Howard O. Thompson Russo Tumulty Nester Thompson Kelly, LLP 240 Cedar Knolls Road Suite 306 Cedar Knolls, NJ 07927 <u>hthompson@russotumulty.com</u> Sharon Weber PPL Energy Plus 2 North 9th Street TW 20 Allentown, PA 18101 sjweber@pplweb.com

Glen Thomas The P³ Group GT Power Group LLC 1060 First Avenue Suite 400 King of Prussia, PA 19406 <u>gthomas@gtpowergroup.com</u>

Divesh Gupta, Esq. Exelon Business Services Corp. 111 Market Place Suite 1200C Baltimore, Maryland 21202 <u>divesh.gupta@constellation.com</u>

Tom Hoatson LS Power Development, LLC 2 Tower Center East Brunswick, NJ 08816 thoatson@lspower.com

Adam Kaufman Executive Director Independent Energy Producers of NJ Five Vaughn Drive, Suite 101 Princeton, NJ 08540 akaufman@kzgrp.com

Anthony Pietranico ConEdison Solutions Inc. Electricity Supply Specialist pietranicoa@conedsolutions.com Christi L. Nicolay Division Director Macquarie Energy LLC 500 Dallas St., Level 31 Houston, TX 77002 Christi.Nicolay@macquarie.com

Joe Wadsworth Vitol Inc. 2925 Richmond Ave, 11th Floor Houston, TX 77098 jxw@vitol.com

Dinkar Bhatia Hartree Partners LP 8 Market Place, Suite 500 A Baltimore, MD 21202 dbhatia@hartreepartners.com

Other Parties

Ray Cantor NJBIA 10 West Lafayette Street Trenton, NJ 08608-2002 rcantor@njbia.org

John Holub NJ Retail Merchants Assoc. 332 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08618 john@njrma.org